

Humanities & Social Sciences Reviews eISSN: 2395-6518, Vol 7, No 5, 2019, pp 618-625 https://doi.org/10.18510/hssr.2019.7571

# EVALUATION OF SOLUS PER AQUA (SPA) FIELD TRAINING PROGRAM IN MATARAM

Siti Istiningsih<sup>1\*</sup>, Zulfiati Syahrial<sup>2</sup>, Mulyono Abdurrahman<sup>3</sup>

<sup>1</sup>Post Graduated Departement of Educational Technology Universitas Negeri Jakarta, Indonesia, <sup>2,3</sup>Profesor at Universitas Negeri Jakarta, Indonesia.

Email: 1\*ningistie@yahoo.co.id, 2zulfiatisyahrial@gmail.com, 3mulyono@yahoo.com

Article History: Received on 30<sup>th</sup> August 2019, Revised on 30<sup>th</sup> September 2019, Published on 18<sup>th</sup> October 2019

#### Abstract

**Purpose:** This study aims to evaluate the components of preparation (antecedents), the components of the transaction (transaction) and the components of learning outcomes (outcomes).

**Methodology:** This research is evaluation research using a qualitative approach supported by a quantitative approach. The data of this study were collected using documentation, observations, and interviews, analyzed by the Stake Model analysis technique, which compares the results obtained with predetermined standards.

**Results:** The results of the study shows the Compensation for the identification of needs analysis, vision mission, and program implementation objectives are appropriate, the curriculum used is a competency-based curriculum with SKKNI standards, the educational qualifications requirements of instructors have not fulfilled the requirements as Level II Spa educators, infrastructure facilities are well met, the financing requirements are well fulfilled, the transaction component of mastery of facilitators and instructors in preparing learning materials is not good enough, and the components of learning outcomes (outcomes) in Spa training on good cognitive aspects, on psychomotor aspects are very good, and test results all Spa training program participants are good.

**Implications:** This research contributes to the form of development of competency test assessment instruments that have not previously been available at the BP-PAUD and Dikmas NTB Lab site.

Keywords: Program Evaluation, Stake Model, Training Spa (Solus Per Aqua), SKKNI, Spa educators.

## INTRODUCTION

Unemployment is one of the problems that exist in Indonesia, especially the West Nusa Tenggara Province. The problem of unemployment must be immediately addressed so that the welfare of the community becomes better. Need appropriate handling efforts to realize community welfare by reducing the number of unemployment and poverty.

Unemployment in West Nusa Tenggara is still quite large, as published by the West Nusa Tenggara Statistics Agency. Recorded the Unemployment Rate in 2013based on education level, there is 28.04 percent of elementary school graduates, 15, 51 percent of junior high school graduates, 43.17 percent of high school graduates and 13.28 percent of graduates of Diploma and Higher Education (Statistik, 2014).

Limited demand for labour and the inability of Human Resources to meet the requirements demanded by business and industry is part of the causes of unemployment. The qualification of education is an important requirement that cannot be met by most job seekers in West Nusa Tenggara Province. The lack of knowledge and skills of most job seekers in the region must be addressed immediately with the right steps.

Various strategic steps by the government in reducing unemployment are handled directly by the government and through non-governmental organizations and self-management. One of the concrete activities in handling unemployment is by organizing educational and training programs for the community.

The education and training program is the right step to improve the quality of human resources because education and training are a form of human investment (human investment). Two things that need to be considered by the government in education and training policies and programs are 1) improving the quality and relevance of education and training. The quality of education and training can be seen from the level of graduates' ability to grow sustainably in the community. 2) New strategies in improving the quality excellence of human resources in West Nusa Tenggara Province.

Appropriate education and training are expected to be able to change people's mindsets in a more advanced direction. Development of education and training is an investment activity in human resources. The more the creation of quality human resources in an area will benefit the regions that have the basic capital of development.

This is the result of the research by Obonyo, Bin, and Maina which shows that the level of education and teacher teaching experience has a significant impact on student learning outcomes (<u>Duke D Obonyo, Prof Chen Bin, 2018</u>).

One form of education and training expected by the people of West Nusa Tenggara is vocational education and training. Vocational education and training is education and training for mastering knowledge and skills that have economic value, following market needs with labor coefficient high education.

Humanities & Social Sciences Reviews eISSN: 2395-6518, Vol 7, No 5, 2019, pp 618-625 https://doi.org/10.18510/hssr.2019.7571

Solus Par Aqua (Spa) is one type of vocational skills program in the field of beauty that is related to beauty and fitness care by providing massage therapy either manually or using tools. This Spa program by BP-PAUD and Dikmas Province was used as a pilot laboratory program held in Mataram.

The program evaluation model implemented is more appropriate by using Robert E.ake's evaluation model because the purpose of this evaluation research is to see the overall implementation of the Spa training program from the stages that have been implemented. Stake based his model on formal evaluations, namely evaluations carried out by outsiders who were not involved with evaluation. The reason is that the evaluation must give a full description and consideration regarding EVRARA. The formal evaluation must pay attention to the situation before an activity takes place when the activity takes place and relates it to various forms of learning outcomes, (Hasan, 2008).

The results of Al-Fauzan and Tarchouna's research explained that a well-designed and developed curriculum by aligning learning objectives, processes, and evaluations had a significant effect on the learning outcomes of the learning population. (Tarchouna, 2017)

## LITERATURE REVIEW

# **Concept Evaluation Program**

Evaluation in the sense of language comes from English, evaluation which means assessment or assessment, this means that evaluation is a process or activity to assess or assess something. Evaluation is a series of systemic activities. A good and effective evaluation process must include a series of activities that are continuous and intact. Evaluation is the most important part of the whole series of activities because evaluation describes the process of activities that have been carried out, as stated by Kaufman and Thomas that, Evaluation is a process used to assess the quality of what is going on? (Thomas, 1980)

The more general opinion about evaluation is explained by Fitzpatrick, Evaluation of identification, clarification, and application of defensible criteria to determine the evaluation of the object's values, or value, regarding those criteria. (Jody L. Fitzpatrick, James R. Sanders, 2004). In the evaluation process, there is identification, clarification, and determination of various criteria for the object being assessed; it is the benefits and values of the object being evaluated.

Evaluation is a process of assessing; the assessment is concerned with various aspects that exist in the context of the evaluation or evaluation. This was also revealed by Stufflebeam and Shinkfield in his book as follows: The Join Committee's (1994) definition states that evaluation is a systematic assessment of the value of merits of objects (Daniel L. Stufflebeam & Anthony J. Shinkfield, 1981). Stufflebeam and Shinkfield mention that evaluation is a systematic assessment of the value or benefit of an object. From the various notions of evaluation mentioned above, evaluation is an assessment process that is planned and carried out systematically to assess the object, and it can be in the form of benefits or value from the program. (Daniel L. Stufflebeam & Anthony J. Shinkfield, 1981)

# **Spa Training Program**

Efforts to improve quality self to be able to have knowledge and skills, as well as being able to live in society well, independently, skillfully and creatively must begin with ourselves with the awareness that improving self quality is important. The ever-changing demands demand the readiness of individuals to be more competitive in achieving their life goals.

Increased knowledge and skills can be obtained through education and training activities, but for the unemployed people in West Nusa Tenggara training is a more appropriate activity considering the background of unemployment in West Nusa Tenggara due to poverty so that many people still do not complete basic education with reasons for not having fees for school, so training by providing skills can be used as living capital.

This was stated by Agustinus (Agustinus, 2013) training is an effort to provide new skills (skills) or improve skills that have been mastered. Furthermore, according to Bernardin and Russell, stating that the training was:

To improve the performance of employees in the work handled now, or something related to the current job. For training effectiveness must involve training learning experience activities must activate tasks that require special expertise, planned, therefore training needs to be designed to be able to bring together organizational and individual goals (Russel, 1998)

So training places a lot of emphasis on increasing the ability to handle a job or emphasis on skills. Meanwhile, according to Kirkpatrick and Kirkpatrick, the definition of training is as follows: "emphasize courses and programs designed to increase knowledge, improve skills, and change attitudes, whether for present job improvement or development in the future" (Kirzpatrick, 2005). Training is a program designed to improve knowledge, skills, and change attitudes both for the improvement of current work or for future development. It can be understood from this opinion that the purpose of the training is to improve the knowledge, skills, and attitudes that can be used and developed in living in a society to achieve welfare.

# METHODOLOGY/MATERIALS

The evaluation study of the Spa training program was oriented to find out the implementation of the Spa training program



at BP-PAUD and Dimas NTB and the achievement of program results by implementing the Robert E. Stake model evaluation program. The research method of implementing Robert E. Stake's program evaluation model uses a combined method (quantitative and qualitative). Combined research is action-oriented research using quantitative and qualitative approaches in the process of implementing a similar study. Combined research is a procedure for collecting data, analyzing data sequentially using quantitative methods and qualitative methods or vice versa. According to Sugiyono, (Sugiyono, 2012) quantitative and qualitative research methods cannot be seen as two research methods that are dichotomous and contradict each other but are methods of complementary methods. Mixed methods research needs to be of high quality that researchers need to mention the use of quantitative and qualitative data and how these methods will be integrated into a study. (Creswell, 2007)

The model used in this study is program evaluation with the Robert E. Stake model because this evaluation model emphasizes what must be measured and how to measure it so Robert E. Stake's model is oriented around the implementation of training programs rather than training products. The main assessment of Stake is the relationship between the purpose of the assessment and the next decision based on the nature of the data collected so that the procedure for the implement.

## **RESULTS AND FINDINGS**

The component Antecedent, in the process for the antecedent training Spa Level II therapist program at the BP-PAUD and Dikmas NTB Lab site, several things included in the component antecedent can be summarized as follows:

- 1. The identification of program requirements analysis is in accordance with the specified standards, namely the program is prepared based on the conditions of the region and the community's needs for employment.
- 2. The relevance of the Spa curriculum (program) with needs analysis is appropriate, the curriculum used is a competency-based curriculum using the SKKNI standard.
- 3. The vision and mission and objectives of the organizers are quite appropriate, the category is quite appropriate because achieving the vision at the point of being able to work and compete on a national and international scale has not been achieved because graduates still work in the NTB Province only.
- 4. The educational qualification requirements are not appropriate and the competency of the facilitator is not supported by the certificate of competence of Level 7 therapists, namely educators and therapist trainers Spa.
- 5. The training participants, have met the requirements according to the standard set, namely participants aged 18-40 years, at least graduated from junior and senior high school and preferably domiciled in the Mataram region.
- 6. Infrastructure facilities have been fulfilled quite in accordance with the standards, some learning media are not used optimally, there is still no teaching aids in the form of puppets as demonstration tools when delivering theories
- 7. Financing is in accordance with the standard, which is funded by the government

The Component Transaction, that is at the implementation of Spa training activities at the Lab site BP-PAUD Dikmas NTB Province has been well implemented, only a few drawbacks in:

- 1. Aspects of preparation do not fulfill the competency/instructor's competency requirements with proof of certificate of competence of a Level 7 Spa therapist as an educator and therapist training examinerSpa, not fulfilled RPP and module, the material is quite in accordance with the division of the amount of time which is 250 hours from the standard time of 240 hours to an excess time of 10 hours and categorized by type and time of implementation (80 hour theory, 140 hours practice, 30 hours internship) excess time 10 hours due to the addition of new material namely Manicure Pedicure, Facial and Hair Spa.
- 2. The unavailability of teaching aids for demonstration activities, the absence of learning media such as LCD and learning videos
- 3. Aspects of implementing activities or processes, there is still a lack of assessment activities, the assessment is only carried out when the training activities are completed as well as the overall assessment of the initial activities and training process

Component Outcomes, learning outcomes have been achieved in three aspects, namely:

- 1. Cognitive Aspects, Test results showed that all trainees received scores that had met the KKM (70). Overall there are 5 people or 50% of participants get a score above 80, while the rest get scores with a range of 70 to 75, because as many as 5 participants or 50% of participants get value relative to the minimum grade of graduation.
- 2. Affective aspects have the result that the average score obtained is 3.95 with a maximum questionnaire score of 5. Based on these results, because it tends to be closer to number 4, it can be said that the attitude of all participants in the Spa training program at BP-PAUD and Dikmas NTB is good.





3. Psychomotor aspects, namely from all aspects tested, namely body scrub, boreh, K3, Body practice materials Massage and P2K, all tested aspects obtain a relatively high average score, which is equal to 90. If the minimum completeness criteria used are 70, then all Spa training program participants can be said to have very good competencies in the provision of Spa services, even though one participant has an 80 in the good category so it can be concluded that the mastery of psychomotor aspects of competence is very good.

The results of the research conducted by Rosana were not. The results of the study show that CIPP evaluation in these activities resulted in two aspects: The first aspect was improving the skills of students and farmers in using ABHS, and these two aspects, namely food crop productivity; (1) cayenne increased 76.4%, (2) increased red onions (56.3%) and (3) of maize increased by 67.8%. Besides, it was also the effect of the application of ABHS on the rate of plant growth. The outcome of this study is the STS teaching materials and the appropriate technology of ABHS with solar energy. (Rosana, Kadarisman, Maryanto, & Sugiharsono, 2017)

## **DISCUSSION**

# No Standards for Implementation of Implementation

#### 1 Antecedent

#### a. Need Analysis

The type of skills implemented must be based on the results of identification of work needs or business opportunities according to the type of skills being trained and is a new business opportunity by empowering local resource potential.

- Criteria for productive age students (18-40 years old), education at least elementary school or equivalent, physically and mentally healthy, attractive, have a strong interest in working as a therapist Spa

#### b. Curriculum

- Using a competency-based curriculum that covers personal competencies, social competencies, academic competencies and competencies professional/vocational
- RPP / syllabus
- Module/teaching material

# c. Vision

- Imagible (imaginable)
- Desirable (interesting)
- Feasible (realistic and achievable)
- Focused (clear)
- Flexible (aspirational and responsive environmental changes
- Communicable (easy to understand)

# Results

# Antecedent a. Need Analysis

The type of skills carried out at the BP-PAUD Dikmas Prov. Lab site NTB is in line with the identification of work needs and business opportunities in the tourism-based NTB Province. The community was trained by Spa to be able to provide good service for tourism visitors in NTB, changing the negative opinion about Spa according to the halal tourism distention in NTB Province. The selected Spa training program raised more changes in people's thinking about a therapist Spa with more skill materials and a professional attitude as a Spa therapist.

The training participants are sufficiently suited to the productive age of 18-40 years and at least high school education, physically and mentally healthy, attractive, and have a strong interest in working as a therapist Spa

# b. Curriculum

- The curriculum used is a competency-based curriculum with SKKNI standards, including personal competence, social competence, academic competence, professional competence that leads to three aspects of learning, namely cognitive, affective and psychomotor aspects.
- The syllabus used is designed by the Spa training program development team based on the curriculum used but no RPP
- The module used is in the form of modules for training materials therapist Spa only, while for other materials modules are not provided

#### c. Vision

- The vision that made the criteria adequate are:
- Imagible ( dapatdibayangkan)
- Desirable (menarik)
- Feasible (realistis dan dapatdicapai)
- Focused (jelas)

The vision that created quite meet the criteria are:

- Imagible (imaginable)
- Desirable (interesting)
- Feasible (realistic and achievable)
- Focused (clear)
- Flexible (aspirational and responsive to environmental changes
- Communicable (easy to understand)





# No Standards for Implementation of Implementation

## Results

Achieving the vision at the point of being able to work and compete on a national and international scale has not been achieved because graduates still work in the NTB Province only

#### d. Mission

The statement contained in the mission is quite appropriate, namely the stages that will be implemented to realize the mission

# e. Objectives

objectives compiled are sufficient in accordance with the objectives of the vision and mission

## f. Facilitator / Instructor

- Minimum high school education
- Have the knowledge, attitude, and skills that mark in teaching/training Spa skills fields
- Experienced in teaching/training spas
- Does not have a certificate as a coach / Spa infrastructure because he has never attended

# g. Infrastructure

- There is a theoretical space with capacity according to the number of students proposed
- Practice room with capacity according to the number of students proposed
- Practice materials and equipment, the number and type according to the proposed skills
- Do not have props

## h. Financing

- Government assistance

#### d. Mission

Statement about what the institution must do in its effort to realize the vision

## e. Objective

Formulate objectives of vision and mission

#### f. Facilitator / Instructor

- Minimum education at high school
- Have the knowledge, attitude, and skills that mark in teaching/training Spa skills fields
- Experienced in teaching/training spas
- Certified as a coach / Spa infrastructure issued by a competent institution (once trained in Level 7 Spa therapists as educators and testers for Spas)

# g. Infrastructure

- Theoretical space with capacity according to the number of students proposed
- Practice room with capacity according to the number of students proposed
- Practice materials and equipment, the number and type according

to the proposed skills

Props

#### h. Financing

- Government assistance
- Community Self-Help
- Mixture
- Alatperaga

## 2. Transaction

## a. Preparation

- Syllabus / RPP
- Module
- The 240 hour material consists of general material (30% = 72 hours) and core material (70% = 168 hours)
- Media (LCD, video)
- Props
- Practice Tools and Materials

# 2 b. Implementation / Process

- Theory
- Practice
- Internship
- Evaluation
- a. The initial assessment is carried out before the learning process to see the readiness to learn, readiness to practice and readiness to entrepreneurship (by interview or questioner)
- b. Assessment during the learning process takes place to find out the development of learning at each stage of learning and at the same time as an improvement in the performance of students

# c. Evaluation

- Local Exams organized by the organizing agency
- Competency Test in place (TUK)

# 2. Transaction

## a. Preparation

- Availability of Syllabus
- RPP not available
- Modules are available only for SPA material
- The 250-hour material is divided into 80 hours theory, 140 hours practice, 30-hour internship takes 10 hours excess
- LCD only available but rarely used
- No props available
  - Practical tools and materials are available

# b. Implementation / Process

- The theory is carried out by lecturing, discussion, role-playing, and game methods
- The practice is carried out with demonstration methods and practice activities as SPA therapists Level II
- Internships carried out in the salon and SPA business
- Assessment Evaluation is only carried out when the training activities are completed as well as the overall assessment of the initial activities and training process



No	Standards for Implementation of Implementation	Results
		<ul> <li>c. Evaluation</li> <li>Local Exams organized by the organizing agency (BP-PAUD and Dikmas NTB)</li> <li>Competency Test in place (TUK</li> </ul>
3	Outcomes  Having competency in the field of therapists spa as evidenced by a letter passing the competency test and at the same time having a mental attitude as professional work as a provision to work in the industrial world and business world professionally (Affective, Cognitive, Psychomotor (Afektif, Kognitif, Psikomotor)	3. Outcomes  Having competency therapist SPAas evidenced by a letter passing the competency test and at the same time having a mental attitude as a professional worker as a provision to work in the industrial world and business world professionally. On the achievement of the cognitive aspect competency test scores is quite good because 50% of participants get a relative value of around 70-75 on the achievement of affective values is good and at the psychomotor value is very good

Every training activity aims to improve the quality of Human Resources (HR) that will be trained especially in this Spa program which masters the basic principles of Spa therapy, and is competent in applying knowledge, skills, work attitudes in the Spa field in order to meet the needs of the Spa industry (Permendiknas, 2010). In addition, training activities also function to improve the quality of institutions as pilot training sites for courses and training institutions in NTB Province. For this reason, for Spa businesses to maintain its image by having a competent workforce, it is necessary to have a nationally standardized Spa education and training institution. The NTB BP-PAUD and Dikmas Spa training program at NTB has used a competency-based curriculum with SKKNI standards but some deficiencies are still found so that improvements and quality of the Level II Spa therapist training program are needed to improve the quality of institutions and improve the quality of actors including facilitators and organizers of training programs.

In addition, the relevance of the Spa curriculum with an analysis of needs must be appropriate, and the curriculum used in the implementation of Leval II SPA therapist training at the NTB BP-PAUD and Dikmas Lab site is in accordance with the established standards, namely competency-based curriculum using the SKKNI standard. The Level II Spa therapist course program provided provides knowledge, skills and work attitudes gained in the learning experience and apprenticeship process in the business world and the Spa industry. On Vision-mission and the objectives of the organizers are quite appropriate, the category is quite appropriate because the achievement of vision at the point of being able to work and compete on a national and international scale has not been achieved because graduates still work in the NTB Province only. The more graduates work in the Spa business around the island of Lombok or they open their own Spa business, there are no data from graduates who work outside the island of Lombok or who work abroad. For the preparation of requirements for educational qualifications that are less suitable and the competence of the facilitator is not supported by a certificate of competence as an instructor a therapist Spa. The facilitator or instructor for the Spa program training at the BP-PAUD and Dikmas Labsite NTB has never attended Level 7 training, specifically training for educators and trainers. They were appointed as Spa instructors based on having had considerable experience in the Spa business so that in terms of competence as a Spa training educator there was still less. In the preparatory aspects of the training participants, they have met the requirements according to the standard set, namely participants aged 18-40 years, at least junior and senior high school graduates and preferably domiciled in the Mataram area, while the specified conditions are aged 16-40 years prioritized for elementary and junior high school graduates and domiciled in Mataram. In the aspect of the preparation of infrastructure already fulfilled quite in accordance with the standards, some learning media are not used optimally, there is still no props in the form of puppets as demonstration tools when conveying theories. Financing is in accordance with the standard, which is funded by the government.

In the process component (Transaction), namely seeing how the facilitator prepares before carrying out training activities, how the facilitator carries out training activities until evaluation activities can be seen from the results of training activities consisting of mastering the facilitator in preparing Training materials (syllabus / RPP, modules and material distribution and time) are still lacking because only one facilitator prepares the syllabus without compiling the RPP, while the special module for Spa material is not supported by modules on other material, the material is available only in English material and material Spa only. The distribution of special material for Spa material and English is in accordance with the order of delivery while other materials such as communication and character education is only given once. The allocation of the time allocation amount is sufficient following the established standards but the methods of Spa training at BP-PAUD and Dikmas NTB are grouped according to the type and timing of their activities. The 250-hour material is divided into 80-hour theory, 140 hours practice, 30-hour internship so that the excess time is 10 hours from the standard set. This advantage is due to the addition of material beyond Level II Spa therapist material, namely material manicure pedicure, facials and Hair Spa which should be given to the training of Level III therapists. Mastery of the facilitator on training activities is sufficient because the assessment activities are only carried out at the end of the activity as a form of evaluation of activities. The selection of training strategies, several stages of theoretical activities have been well



implemented, several learning methods in training have been used such as lecture methods, role-playing, discussion, and games. Practical training activities begin with explanations, demonstrations, and practices ending with evaluation of activities. Utilization of infrastructure is quite good, the only LCD is still rarely used, while LCDs are widely available at BP-PAUD and Dikmas NTB, learning videos are also not used which should be shown more often as reinforcement understanding of trainees is never used, props such as puppets are not available while it is very much needed in demonstration activities when the facilitator explains the material.

Next is on the components of learning(outcomes outcomes), namely the achievement of the cognitive aspect competency test scores is quite good because 50% of participants get a relative value of around 70-75, the test results show that all trainees get a score that has met the specified KKM (70) by training institutions. Overall there are 5 people or 50% of participants get a score above 80, while the rest get scores with a range of 70 to 75, because as many as 5 participants or 50% of participants get value relative to the minimum grade of graduation. Affective aspects have the result that the average score obtained is 3.95 with a maximum questionnaire score of 5. Based on these results, because it tends to be closer to number 4, it can be said that the attitude of all participants in the Spa training program at BP-PAUD and Dikmas NTB is good. Psychomotor aspects, namely from all aspects tested, namely body scrub, boreh, K3, Body Massage and P2K practice materials, all tested aspects obtain a relatively high average score, which is equal to 90. If the minimum completeness criteria used are 70, then all Spa training program participants can be said to have very good competencies in the provision of Spa services, even though one participant has an 80 in the good category so it can be concluded that the mastery of psychomotor aspects of competence is very good. From the results of the cognitive, affective and psychomotor aspects of the competency test that have been attended by Level II Spa therapist training at the BP-PAUD and Dikmas NTB Lab site, it can be concluded that the participants already have good competence as a Level II Spa therapist and are ready to enter the world work or open your own Spa service business.

## CONCLUSION

The Component Antecedent, in the antecedent training of Spa Level II therapist programs at the BP-PAUD and Dikmas NTB Lab site, a number of things included in the component antecedent can be summarized as follows: (1) Identification of program requirements analysis in accordance with specified standards (2) The relevance of the Spa curriculum with needs analysis is appropriate, the curriculum used, (3) The vision and mission and objectives of the organizers are quite appropriate, the categories are sufficient, (4) Requirements for education qualifications are not appropriate and competency of facilitators is not supported by competency certificates Level therapists, (5) Training participants, have met the requirements according to the standard set, (6) Infrastructure facilities have been fulfilled quite in accordance with the standards, (7) Financing is in accordance with the standard, namely funded by the government Component Transaction, that at the Spa training activities at LabsiteBP-PAUD Dikmas Provinsi NTB has been well implemented, Component Outcomes, learning outcomes have been achieved.

# **ACKNOWLEDGMENTS**

Thanks to Prof. Dr. Zulfiati Syahrial, M.Pd and Prof. Dr Mulyono Abdurrahman for giving me your guidance, patience, and being the best inspiring supervisors.

# REFERENCES

- 1. Agustinus, H. (2013). Assesmen Kebutuhan Organisasi Persekolahan-Tinjauan Perilaku Organisasi Menuju Comprehensive Multilevel Planning. Jakarta: Gramedia.
- 2. Creswell. (2007). Qualitative Inquiry and Research Design: Choosing Among Five Approaches (Second Edition). London: Sage Publication, Inc.
- 3. Daniel L. Stufflebeam & Anthony J. Shinkfield. (1981). Evaluation Theory, Models & Applications (Vol. 00). San Francisco: Jossey Bass.
- 4. Duke D Obonyo, Prof Chen Bin, G. F. M. (2018). Is Teacher Education Level and Experience Impetus for Student Achievement? Evidence from Public Secondary Schools in Kenya. American Journal of Educational Research and Reviews, 3(21), 14. <a href="https://doi.org/10.28933/ajerr-2018-04-0101">https://doi.org/10.28933/ajerr-2018-04-0101</a>
- 5. Hasan, H. (2008). Evaluasi Kurikulum. Bandung: PT Rosdakarya.
- 6. Jody L. Fitzpatrick, James R. Sanders, B. R. W. (2004). Program Evaluation Alternative Approaches and Practical Guidelines. Boston: Pearson Education.
- 7. Kirzpatrick, K. and. (2005). Evaluating Training Programs: The Four Levels, Third Edition. San Francisco: Berrett-Koehler Publishers Inc.
- 8. Permendiknas. (2010). Peraturan Menteri Pendidikan Nasional Republik Indonesia.
- 9. Rosana, D., Kadarisman, N., Maryanto, A., & Sugiharsono, A. (2017). The evaluation of science learning program, technology and society application of Audio Bio Harmonic System with solar energy to improve crop productivity. Jurnal Pendidikan IPA Indonesia, 6(1), 63–70. <a href="https://doi.org/10.28933/ajerr-2018-04-0101">https://doi.org/10.28933/ajerr-2018-04-0101</a>
- 10. Russel, J. E. dan H. J. B. (1998). Human Resources Management an Expehental Approach. New York: Mc Graw Hill.
- 11. Statistik, B. P. (2014). Badan Pusat Statistik, Nusa Tenggara Barat dalam Angka 2014.





- 12. Sugiyono. (2012). Metode Penelitian Pendidikan:Pendekatan kualitatif,kualitatis, dan R&D. Bandung: Penerbit Alfabeta,bandung.
- 13. Tarchouna, A. A. H. A. and N. (2017). The Role of an Aligned Curriculum Design in the Achievement of Learning Outcomes. Journal of Education and E-Learning Research, 4(3), 81–91. https://doi.org/10.20448/journal.509.2017.43.81.91
- 14. Thomas., K. R. dan S. (1980). Evaluation Without Pear. New York: New Viewpoint.