SYSTEMATIC LITERATURE REVIEW ON THE REQUIREMENT OF QURANIC PSYCHOTHERAPY MODEL: PAEDOPHILIA RECOVERY

FOUNDATION

Abur Hamdi Usman*, Muhammad Fakhrur Razi Shahabudin², Marlon Pontino Guleng³, Razaleigh Muhamat@Kawangit⁴

¹,²,³Faculty of Islamic Civilisation Studies, Kolej Universiti Islam Antarabangsa Selangor (KUIS), Malaysia; ⁴Faculty of Islamic Studies, Universiti Kebangsaan Malaysia (UKM), Malaysia.

Article History: Received on 31st November 2019, Revised on 4th August 2020, Published on 11th August 2020

PurposE of the study: This article intends to review the pieces of literature on Quranic psychotherapy for the rehabilitation of paedophilia.

Methodology: For this article, content analysis has been used to discuss the data from documents, such as books, journals, and other related materials which had been reviewed and referred to Quran as the main source.

Main Findings: This article found that the essential need for Quranic psychotherapy for the rehabilitation of paedophilia and the development of a special module to curb this issue in Malaysia.

Applications of this study: This article can be useful for government, academia, psychotherapist, parents, etc. to build and apply the module together and prevent this paedophile crime from continuing to occur.

Novelty/Originality of this study: Only a very few have examined the children who often become victims of sexual abuse. Children also often misunderstood the meaning of affection shown by adults. Thus, this opportunity used by some parties to exploit the meaning of love so that crimes like paedophilia occurs. Also, sexual abuse affects the psychological well-being of the perpetrator and the victims of paedophilia, thereby changing their sexual orientation.

Keywords: Paedophilia, Model, Psychotherapy, Rehabilitation, Systematic Literature Review.

INTRODUCTION

This article intends to review the literature on Quranic psychotherapy for the rehabilitation of paedophilia. From a linguistic perspective, psychotherapy derives from the word ‘psyche’ meaning soul and heart. And the word therapy means medicine and healing (Kapchuk, 2002). In Arabic, the ‘psyche’ can be more to ‘nafs’ in the form of its name ‘anfus’ or ‘nafus’ which means soul, spirit, blood, body, person, self, and own self (Munawir, nd.). Thus, etymological psychotherapy means the treatment of one mental aspect (de l'Etoile, 2002). Psychotherapy is a mental treatment, or more precisely, defined as the treatment and rehabilitation of mental disorders through psychological means.

The Quran as God’s book is the first and only source major of all Islamic teachings and serves as guidance or guidelines for humanity in achieving happiness in the world and the hereafter (Ismail, Hassan, Malek, & Usman, 2019). The Quran as a psychotherapist alters human tendencies and behaviors, guides people, alters and fools leads people to a better path, and equips them with new ideas about habits and missions in life, values, morals and new life ideas (Saged, et al., 2018). Thus, the process of learning is a process of refining thoughts, attitudes, habits, and behaviors. Psychotherapy is a previously unsuccessful study treatment process. From this, the patient acquires erroneous or misleading thoughts about others, the lives, and problems they face that cause them to anxiety (Usman, 2005).

Quranic psychotherapy is key to becoming a cure for all diseases. Whether the treatment touches the physical or the interior of the patient. In addition, to paying attention of the healing process, Islamic psychotherapy emphasizes on self-improvement efforts, such as cleansing the heart, mastering the influence of primitive impulses, raising self-esteem, establishing good morals and increasing the potential of trust as a servant of Allah and Caliphate on the earth (Hakim, 2016). However, there was a misunderstanding when the public viewed psychotherapy as a mere treatment for the psychology of the patient, the Messenger of Allah (pbuh) said [al-Bukhari, Kitab al-Iman, Bab Faddl Istibra’ Lidinih, hadith number 52], to wit:

“Know in this body there is a piece of flesh: if it is good then the whole body is good, and if the flesh is corrupt then the whole body is broken, and know that’s the heart.”

This shows that the heart is the defective factor that conducts to individual’s moral, so it is not surprising that the concept of treatment in Islam leads to reviving the function of the heart in the body (Deuraseh & Abu Talib, 2005; Haque, 2018; Skinner, 2010). The concept of the Quran as psychotherapy refers to the Quran as a cure for mankind, which covers all diseases except death. Allah says in Surah al-Isra’ verse 82, it says:

“We send down (stage by stage) in the Quran that which is a healing and a mercy to those who believe: to the unjust it causes nothing but loss after loss.”

 INTRODUCTION

This article intends to review the literature on Quranic psychotherapy for the rehabilitation of paedophilia. From a linguistic perspective, psychotherapy derives from the word ‘psyche’ meaning soul and heart. And the word therapy means medicine and healing (Kapchuk, 2002). In Arabic, the ‘psyche’ can be more to ‘nafs’ in the form of its name ‘anfus’ or ‘nafus’ which means soul, spirit, blood, body, person, self, and own self (Munawir, nd.). Thus, etymological psychotherapy means the treatment of one mental aspect (de l'Etoile, 2002). Psychotherapy is a mental treatment, or more precisely, defined as the treatment and rehabilitation of mental disorders through psychological means.

The Quran as God’s book is the first and only source major of all Islamic teachings and serves as guidance or guidelines for humanity in achieving happiness in the world and the hereafter (Ismail, Hassan, Malek, & Usman, 2019). The Quran as a psychotherapist alters human tendencies and behaviors, guides people, alters and fools leads people to a better path, and equips them with new ideas about habits and missions in life, values, morals and new life ideas (Saged, et al., 2018). Thus, the process of learning is a process of refining thoughts, attitudes, habits, and behaviors. Psychotherapy is a previously unsuccessful study treatment process. From this, the patient acquires erroneous or misleading thoughts about others, the lives, and problems they face that cause them to anxiety (Usman, 2005).

Quranic psychotherapy is key to becoming a cure for all diseases. Whether the treatment touches the physical or the interior of the patient. In addition, to paying attention of the healing process, Islamic psychotherapy emphasizes on self-improvement efforts, such as cleansing the heart, mastering the influence of primitive impulses, raising self-esteem, establishing good morals and increasing the potential of trust as a servant of Allah and Caliphate on the earth (Hakim, 2016). However, there was a misunderstanding when the public viewed psychotherapy as a mere treatment for the psychology of the patient, the Messenger of Allah (pbuh) said [al-Bukhari, Kitab al-Iman, Bab Faddl Istibra’ Lidinih, hadith number 52], to wit:

“Know in this body there is a piece of flesh: if it is good then the whole body is good, and if the flesh is corrupt then the whole body is broken, and know that’s the heart.”

This shows that the heart is the defective factor that conducts to individual’s moral, so it is not surprising that the concept of treatment in Islam leads to reviving the function of the heart in the body (Deuraseh & Abu Talib, 2005; Haque, 2018; Skinner, 2010). The concept of the Quran as psychotherapy refers to the Quran as a cure for mankind, which covers all diseases except death. Allah says in Surah al-Isra’ verse 82, it says:

“We send down (stage by stage) in the Quran that which is a healing and a mercy to those who believe: to the unjust it causes nothing but loss after loss.”

(862) www.hssr.in
Thus, the whole Quran is a healer like the verse shown above. The Quran is a cure for the heart from ignorance (stupidity), doubt, and hesitation. Allah does not bring down (healers) from the broader, more beneficial, greater, and more glorious heavens to dispel diseases beyond the Quran (Al-Jawziyyah, 1992). Meaning that the Quran is the main source of medicine by the word of Allah.

When a person deviates from the nature that Allah has set for him because it is influenced by ‘worldly’ elements and ignores spiritual elements, then he has entered the boundaries of disease (Haron, 2016). And all the problems that come with fitrah (to originate something) have entered into the boundaries of disease, as well as criminal cases, inverse sex, as well as the focus of this study on paedophilia issues. Paedophilia is not a new issue that is attacking Malaysian (for example) today, but it is an issue that the public does not care about due to lack of awareness and knowledge among parents and children. Paedophilia or sexual harassment of children is a serious crime in today’s Malaysian society (Usman, Salleh, Shaharudin, Wazir, Nasir, & Shahabudin, 2019). Thus, the Quran as the main content of psychotherapy is a new topic that has been discussed in studies of Islamic scholars in Malaysia and the Islamic world in general.

Several forms of worship are found to work as therapies for human sexual misconduct. Examples like prayer, fasting, zakat (taking some particular property, according to the specific characteristics and to be given to certain beneficiary groups), reciting the Quran and zikr (remembrance) (Mansor, Jodi, Kadir, & Abdullah, 2016; Masroom & Wan Ismail, 2013). The value of Sufism in one's prayers can play a role in purifying the soul and nourishing the heart and realizing the virtues of the self. It also elevates the dignity of the prayer itself to the level closest to Allah (Hawwa, nd.). This heartwarming prayer will protect us from negative things. In fact, Hawwa explains that perfect prayer enforcement can destroy the seeds of arrogance, pride, rebellion, and opposition to God while acknowledging the rububiyyah of Allah (a wholehearted acknowledgment that Allah is God of the whole universe) and deepening the meaning of ‘ubudiyyah (servitude) to Him (Hawwa, nd.).

Fasting is considered to be a stronghold against impulse, spiritual enrichment, and peace of mind, acknowledged by Hawwa (1988) and Al-Ghazali (2000) who say fasting works to treat sexual misconduct as classified as orgasmic illness and is caused by cunt and stomach. Also, to what extent zakat plays a role in the tazkiyah al-nafs (spiritual purification) can be seen from the main purpose of the charity itself, which is to purify one's possessions and to fulfill the rights of others who are more in need of fulfillment and even purify the human soul from stubbornness (Hawwa, nd.).

Zikr gives peace to the hearts and emotions of each of the perpetrators (Taher & Yusof, 2014) as the perpetrator will always remember Allah comprehensively and express his feelings of peace (al-Ra’d, 13:28). This practice will also erode the pride of man and prevent the loss of man from his God (al-Ghazali, 2000). This is stated in the Quran: “Then do ye remember Me; I will remember you. Be grateful to Me, and reject not Faith” (al-Baqarah: 152). The recitation of the Quran is recognized to be capable of healing human diseases (Yusuf, 10:52). Thus, (Ibn Khaldun, 1995) in his work “al-Muqaddimah” emphasized the importance of studying the Quran as it is the basis of all the basics of learning in the Islamic State since it is one of the religious symbols as well as strengthening the faith.

It is in these contexts that the authors conducted a thorough literature search on Quranic psychotherapy to establish a module for the rehabilitation of victims of paedophilia.

RESEARCH METHODOLOGY

This research is qualitative research by employing a systematic literature review method. This method applies a systematic search to identify Quranic psychotherapy in the rehabilitation of paedophilia. The method of study is the document analysis of books, journals, and thesis written by scholars. The reference rates are from 2004 until 2018. One of the reasons for the literature review since 2004 is that discussions about psychotherapy were introduced and reviewed that year. While most studies on paedophilia began to be a major topic in 2016 due to the larger case in paedophilia history, the arrest of a British citizen, Richard Huckle was charged on sexually assaulted nearly 200 children in Malaysia.

Each of the previous studies was compiled in two terms, the first part was on the psychotherapy of the Quran, and the second part was on the issues of paedophilia. Thus, any works of literature that not focusing on the subject matter were excluded from the systematic literature system.

Figure 1 presents the study using a systematic literature review method that includes years of study, background, issue, methodology, and research findings of the literature review. This method applies a systematic search to identify the needs of the Quranic psychotherapy module for paedophilia recovery. The principles of systematic literature review (SLR) have been followed by modern researchers to see the phenomena surrounding research keywords (Michie & Williams, 2003; Salleh, Usman, Wazir, Abdullah, & Ismail, 2019). In this study, the keywords Quranic psychotherapy and paedophilia were used to obtain research data from 2004 to 2018. This study was assisted by access to Google Scholar, Researchgate, and Academia databases.

The theme of paedophilia and psychotherapy being the main criteria for this research analysis. From 26 total of articles related to the study, only 10 works of literature were accepted for analysis. Meanwhile, the rest of the 16 articles were not selected, due to the focus literature review did not similar to the highlight and objective of this research.
RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

Child abuse and related experiences (or known as child maltreatment) have recently been recognized by the World Health Organisation as having broad implications for human development and the prevention of public health problems (Anda, Butchart, Felitti, & Brown, 2010). Early hospital-based studies indicate that low socioeconomic status (social classes IV and V), family disharmony or disruption, and divorced or separated parents, personality disorders, and parental substance abuse were associated with child physical abuse (Kasim, Shafie, & Cheah, 1994). Another study among cases confirmed in Kuala Lumpur General Hospital showed that sociodemographic factors surrounding child sexual abuse included being female, absence of another adult at home, unemployment, and history of drug abuse among the perpetrators (Kassim & Kasim, 1995).

The paedophilia associated with child trafficking or human trafficking is one of the fastest-growing industries in the world and is currently the third-largest international crime industry after illegal drugs and arms trafficking, making a profit of $32 Billion annually (ILO, 2005). According to the Global Report on trafficking in persons 2012 by the United Nations Office on Drugs and crime, women constitute about 59% of the victims of human trafficking globally followed by girls at 17%, men at 14%, and boys at 10%. As for Southeast Asia and Pacific, of all the human trafficking victims detected from the year 2007-2010, 39% are children and 61% are adults (UNODC, 2012). Human trafficking also known as modern-day slavery comes in many forms. The most common forms of human trafficking in Southeast Asia are baby trafficking, child trafficking, sex trafficking, labor trafficking, and organ trafficking. Various exploitations are also linked to each type of trafficking. Sexual exploitation, forced labor, domestic servitude, and organ harvesting are among the four broad categories of such exploitations (United Nations Protocol to Prevent, Suppress and Punish Trafficking in Persons, especially Women and Children, 2000).

Individuals who have committed sexual crimes vary in their risk for recidivism. For some offenders who have been convicted of sexual crimes, their risk of being convicted of a new sexual crime is no different from the risk presented by individuals with no history of sexual crimes. Others present substantial recidivism risk, both in the short- and long-term. In general, the risk for sexual recidivism increases to the extent that individuals have problems with sexual self-regulation (deviant sexual interests, sexual preoccupation) and difficulties conforming to the demands and expectations of society (antisocial orientation) (Hanson & Yates, 2013). We believe that useful guidance to the development of effective treatment programs for sexual offenders can be found in the accreditation standards developed by national prison services and by the application of the “what works” principles for interventions with general offenders (Andrews & Bonta, 2010).

In order to systematically analyze this study, 10 works of literature have been identified as important indicators for generating space and gap in the study of the needs of the Quranic psychotherapy modules specifically for paedophilia offenders.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No</th>
<th>Research</th>
<th>Years</th>
<th>Research background</th>
<th>Issues/gap</th>
<th>Method</th>
<th>Research output</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Musa &amp; Sa’ari</td>
<td>2004</td>
<td>Theory of Islamic Psychotherapy in Dealing with Stress</td>
<td>Proving the theory of Islamic psychotherapy according to Muslim scholars it can reduce the stress experienced by individuals.</td>
<td>Qualitative study</td>
<td>The theory of Islamic psychotherapy can help individuals in reducing stress.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Syed</td>
<td>2012</td>
<td>Methods of Organize and develop a</td>
<td>Qualitative</td>
<td>The nine levels in</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 1: Systematic Literature Review on Quranic Psychotherapy and Paedophilia
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Authors</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Study Type</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Muhsin</td>
<td>Psychotherapy Based on the Concept of Maqamat: A Study of the Book of Qut al-Qulub Abu Talib al-Makki</td>
<td>Descriptive study</td>
<td>Recommended form of therapy for treatment methods to cleanse the soul from spiritual ailments.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nen, Ibrahim, Hoesni &amp; Rahman</td>
<td>The Case Study of Girls’ Incest: Understanding the Experience from a Victim's Perspective</td>
<td>Qualitative study</td>
<td>Abu Talib al-Makki’s Sufism doctrine are organized into four levels.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Haron</td>
<td>The Concept of al-Shifa in the Quran: A Study of the Method of Ibn Qayyim al Jawziyyah.</td>
<td>Qualitative study</td>
<td>To gain a deeper understanding of the victim's perspective of the incest experience that the victim experienced.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Probosiwi &amp; Bahransya</td>
<td>Paedophilia and Sexual Violence: Issues and Protections for Children</td>
<td>Qualitative study</td>
<td>Respondents reported feelings of confusion, guilt, fear, self-blame, and feeling trapped in what they experienced.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hakim</td>
<td>Quranic psychotherapy as a concept and model</td>
<td>Qualitative study</td>
<td>Ibn Qayyim used the approach to place spiritual value and to emphasize the basis of transcendence (ishitibāk) in medical science.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Manaf &amp; Yusof</td>
<td>Social Support Issues among Child Sexual Abuse Victims at a Preservation and Protection Institution</td>
<td>Qualitative study</td>
<td>Paedophilia is a serious problem. It must be addressed immediately by all aspects of government - the people, the business world, and the government itself. It is the central and regional government.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Izhar, Khair &amp; Shanmugaiah</td>
<td>Protection and Well-being of Sexual Harassment: A Review of the Law in Malaysia</td>
<td>Qualitative study</td>
<td>Quranic psychotherapy has a wider reach than general psychology.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Aun &amp; Yusof</td>
<td>Parental Knowledge of Paedophilia Regarding</td>
<td>Qualitative study</td>
<td>Generate some social support issues that need to be addressed by the holder.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

865 | www.hssr.in  © Usman et al.
Children paedophilia. This study was conducted to explore parental knowledge of paedophilia.

| 10 | Nor | 2018 | Child Sexual Offences Act 2017: Improvement of Sexual Criminal Law against Children in Malaysia | The absence of specific laws relating to pornography, sexual grooming, and sexual abuse in the existing legislation has been identified as a leading cause of child sexual abuse. | Qualitative study Analyze the types of child sex offenses covered by Act 792 and issues related to their use and implementation in Malaysia. |

Referring to Table 1 of the systematic literature highlights, a total of 10 studies related to Quranic psychotherapy and paedophilia. Six (6) studies are discussing the issues of child sexual abuses or paedophilia, and only 4 studies addressing on Quranic psychotherapy, Theory of Islamic Psychotherapy in Dealing with Stress, Quranic psychotherapy as a concept and model, The concept of al-Shifa in the Quran: A Study of the Method of Ibn Qayyim al-Jawziyyah, and Methods of Psychotherapy Based on the Concept of Maqamat: A Study of the Book of Qut al-Qulab Abu Talib al-Makki. Based on the systematic literature review, it clearly shows how little research on paedophilia has been conducted specifically in Malaysia, as 2 of the literature's highlights refer to studies from Indonesia.

The Diagnostic Statistical manual states that paedophilia not only occurs when children indulge in sexual activity with children but also acts of preserving, fantasy, and imagining sexual activity with children is also referred to as paedophilia (American Psychiatric Association, 2000). About 89 percent of paedophilia cases are made by people who know the victim closely. The fact was revealed from a study by a panel of Australian researchers who reported that only 11.1 percent of paedophilia cases involved unidentified individuals. The scenario comes as a result of paedophilia perpetrators who think they are in a safe and comfortable zone because their acts of rape and profanity will not be exposed by the victims (Eher, Olver, Heurix, Schilling & Rettenberger, 2015).

Nowadays, parental abuse of children in a family institution increasingly prevalent in Malaysian society. We are often served with a variety of heartbreaking cases until it is heard that some cases lead to death. Various approaches have been used to overcome this problem from becoming a thorn in the flesh of Malaysian society. One of the approaches that can be used to address these concerns is the counseling approach (Alavi & Che Din, 2007).

You will not talk to the people, something that they do not understand, except that it will become an object of slander among them.

One of the contributing factors to paedophilia misbehavior is the neglect of parents who do not provide proper sex education when someone reaches adolescence. As well as the factors of moral humility and the mentality of the offender who cannot control his passions. Another factor is that the economy has the opportunity and the advantage of attracting victims (Ningsih & Afriona, 2017). The concern is that experts disagree on the potential for paedophilia patients to recover completely. Most countries focus on preventing the repetition of paedophilia. Various aspects of treatment exist, such as drugs to lower libido such as lowering testosterone levels with antiandrogenic therapy. Another drug that is tried is selective-serotonin reuptake inhibitors. Psychotherapy is also important, but some treatments are considered controversial to change the sexual orientation of the individual away from the child (Khean, 2015).

A jail term of 20 to 30 years is a way of managing criminals for child sexual abuse cases in most countries (Finkelhor, 2009) and that period is sufficient. However, in Indonesia, juvenile offenders are subject to chemical penalties and death sentences for child sex offenses while also using electronic monitors to control their activities at all times after being released from prison. Offenders will also be charged with using certain drugs that can reduce testosterone levels and sexual behavior. Similar penalties have also been proposed in India to address the seriousness of sexual crimes against women and children (Gill & Harrison, 2013).

In addition to these penalties, the Act also emphasizes on the rehabilitation of offenders. Section 26 provides for remedial counseling to be given to offenders as additional punishment while serving time in prison. England and Wales, for example, have introduced criminal rehabilitation programs to reduce the risk of recurrence of crime among sexual
offenders (Wobner, 2016). Various actions have been taken by several countries that facing increasing numbers of paedophilia cases, leading many countries to take initiatives to increase penalties for paedophiles. There is no denying that there are several modules of treatment based on medicine, psychology, and counselling. Therefore, studies on the needs of psychotherapy modules are seen as important to conduct to analyze the factors and causes of these crimes, and the Quran also a new rehabilitation module in the paedophile rehabilitation process. So there is no kind of disease, either spiritual or physical, but in the Quran, there are ways to guide that lead to the cure and the causes of its healing (Al-Jawziyyah, 1992). Allah says in surah al-Rad verse 28:

“Those who believe and whose hearts find satisfaction in the remembrance of Allah: for without doubt in the remembrance of Allah do hearts find satisfaction”.

Quranic psychotherapy sees the verse above as a niche in recovery and treatment because the heart is an organ that is spiritually linked to God. Therefore, it is not surprising that the word of Allah in surah Qaf verse 16 says:

Meaning: “It was We who created man and We know what dark suggestions his soul makes to him: for We are nearer to him than (his) jugular vein”.

The main subject in treating problems and illnesses is the heart (Ashy, 1999), so Quranic psychotherapy looks to Quranic verses that can educate the human heart and appetite. According to Mujib & Mudzakir (2001), psychotherapy in Islam is capable of healing all aspects of psychopathology, be it worldly in the hereafter or modern human disease, referring to the expression of ‘Ali bin Abi Talib as follows:

“The remedies are of five types, namely reading the Quran while understanding the meaning, performing night prayers, interacting with good people, increasing fasting, and remembrance (zikr). Whoever can do one of these five types of remedies then Allah will grant his wish (his request by healing the disease).”

CONCLUSION

The use of a systematic literature review method clarifies that several issues are related to paedophilia and Quranic psychotherapy. In addition, based on the literature, there is a gap in research that leads to the development of the Quranic psychotherapy module for the rehabilitation of paedophilia. It should be noted that the construction of the psychotherapy module is based on the Quran and the descriptions of the Prophet’s hadith. Several existing modules will be reviewed for selection to form the basis of the Quranic psychotherapy module for paedophilia rehabilitation. And it should be clear that the construction of this module is specific to paedophiles, meaning the perpetrator of the crime. Because the study focused only on the treatment module, not the prevention module. Accordingly, the study will conduct several observations and interviews with a prison officer, specialist doctors, religious experts, and psychiatrists. Thus, bureaucracy and cooperation with prisons and hospitals are an important element in the success of this module. This study is an initiative to treat this problem from continuing to become a thorn in the flesh, and indirectly destroyed the family institution systems. Therefore, awareness and action to produce Quranic treatment modules need to be undertaken to curb the issues of paedophilia.

LIMITATION AND STUDY FORWARD

Two things that are limiting to this study are the lack of reference and expert sources. References from studies in Malaysia regarding paedophilia are still at a moderate level, most studies referencing external studies. This study in the future hopes to build a psychotherapy module of the Quran and al-Sunnah treatment for paedophilia.

AUTHORS CONTRIBUTION

Abur Hamdi Usman as a mastermind of the article, Muhammad Fakhrur Razi Shahabudin was provided for Systematic Literature Review. Marlon Pontino Guleng arranging method of study, and Razaleigh Muhamat@Kawangit who finalize paper for English proofreading.

REFERENCES


