

TOWARDS A CULTURE OF INCLUSION: A STUDY OF ETHNIC DIVERSITY AND INTERCULTURAL TOLERANCE

Muhammad Faisal Aziz^{1*}, Farah Latif Naz², Farid Ullah Khan³, Fazlur Rahman⁴, Wali Muhammad⁵

^{1*}Lecturer, University of Technology & Applied Sciences, Ibri, Oman; ²Lecturer, Department of Education, Bahauddin Zakariya University, Multan, Pakistan; ³Endeavour Fellow, Crawford School of Public Policy, The Australian National University (ANU), Canberra, Australia; ⁴Professor, Qurtuba University of Science and Information Technology, Peshawar, Pakistan; ⁵Lecturer, Faculty of Social Sciences and Humanities, Balochistan University of Information Technology Engineering and Management Sciences, Quetta, Balochistan, Pakistan.

Email: ^{1*}faisal_dawar@yahoo.com, ²Farahlatif@bzu.edu.pk, ³fariduk.anu@gmail.com, ⁴drfazlur@qurtuba.edu.pk, ⁵wali.mohammad@buitms.edu.pk

Article History: Received on 22nd January 2021, Revised on 21st March 2021, Published on 29th April 2021

Abstract

Purpose of the study: This study aimed to explore the benefits and threats of accepting diversity and examine the level of intercultural tolerance in higher educational institutions (HEIs).

Methodology: This is an empirical study conducted through quantitative methods based on survey research. Document analysis technique was used to verify the diversity in the target population, i.e., higher educational institutions (HEIs). The researcher collected data from 191 students from 12 universities in non-contrived settings.

Principal Findings: The results indicated that overall, students have a positive attitude towards diversity except for the job market and social environment for minority groups which scored very low. Similarly, intergroup anxiety and productivity loss were found to be threats caused by diversity in HEIs. Regarding tolerance, most respondents were optimistic about their positive behaviour towards other cultures and ethnicities.

Application of this study: This study would benefit university presidents, chancellors, and other high-level administrators. This research will also help explain why people are prejudiced in today's multiethnic society. This study is conducted for higher educational institutes.

The novelty of this study: The study recommends that while developing a curriculum, it is essential to incorporate learning materials related to accepting diversity and creating tolerant behaviours, which can lead to a healthy and inclusive learning environment.

Keywords: *Inclusion, Diversity, Tolerance, Culture, Ethnicities, Higher Education Institutions (HEIs), Higher Education.*

INTRODUCTION

Higher Education is essential for the survival and growth of any country. This growth has made it inevitable for universities to offer Education to a diverse community of students. Also, critical cultural aspects of the developing world should be noticed. One of them is to pay attention to and think about the differences between cultures. It is essential to develop a culture of inclusion to fight against intolerance and encourage people to accept cultural differences.

Given that people have different ways of being, the only way to reach intercultural tolerance based on transcendence and productive/constructive engagement is through recognizing differences. In a multicultural environment, tolerance is the language of building culture and passing it on. Since tolerance is ideal for integration, diversity, and intercultural and interreligious interaction, European policies today encourage it. Those who value human wisdom and principles talk about these things (Turkan, 2015).

"Culture" is one of the most divisive ideas today because it means different things to different people, changes over time, and is defined differently in specialized literature. When we talk about "culture", we mean the learned ways of living. As a living process, it includes the ideas, values, norms, and beliefs that guide most people's actions (Bushnaq, 2013). For the education sector that focuses on knowledge and understanding of religions and the people who practice them, teaching methods must show religious traditions fairly and accurately, including their diversity, and allow students to interact with what they have learned (Jackson, 2019). Maussen and Bader (2012) argue that Education is more than just one part of modern society; it is also an essential part of how people learn to get along with each other. We do not teach adults in the classroom. Instead, we work with young people who are still growing. The fact that school is a time of "growing towards maturity" and "gradual increase in autonomy" is important when it comes to identity, values, ideas, cultural and religious practices, convictions, and choices, as this can lead to very different situations and things to think about than when dealing with adults. Students are forced to go to institutions where they will meet students from different cultural, social, and religious backgrounds. This makes universities a place where diversity issues tend to become very intense and hard to avoid. Tolerance is accepting others, even though they do not believe or act the same way as you do. We should not be hostile to people who disagree with us. Instead, we should be willing to debate and recognize that the other person's point of view may be just as valid as our own (Maussen & Bader, 2012).

This study talks about the importance, urgency, and current state of cultural diversity in Pakistan's higher education institutions (HEIs). One of the biggest problems in higher Education over the past 20 years is knowing how to meet the needs of a more diverse group of students from different cultures and races. Pakistan is home to many different races, religions, languages, ways of dressing, and cooking. Pakistan has not been able to use cultural diversity to promote mutual respect, peaceful co-existence, and the growth of peace in society ([Shah, 2018](#)).

Diverse democratic nation-states like Pakistan find it hard to create a national political and educational narrative in which all groups are structurally included and feel allegiance. Also, giving different groups a chance to keep parts of their own religious, regional, or community culture. [Banks \(2009\)](#) opined, "Schools and nations cannot push the cultures of groups to the side and expect them to feel structurally included in the nation and have a strong commitment to it". Also, marginalized students portrayed as the "other" in official narratives may be drawn to alternative narratives reinforcing their sense of being unrecognized and undervalued. Therefore, it is essential to look at issues of cultural diversity nuancedly. If people do not, they might give extreme groups more credibility by supporting their more attractive stories. Pakistan consists of people from many different ethnic groups and religions. This has been officially recognized in policy documents for Education that were written after 2006. This was done to determine how to educate the country's diverse population. The National Education Policy of 2009 says "to build national unity by respecting all faiths and religions and recognizing cultural and ethnic diversity".

Regarding Pakistan's religious minorities, the stated goal of the NEP 2009 was to "give minorities suitable facilities for their cultural and religious development, allowing them to participate in the general national effort successfully". Human rights issues have yet to be included in previous lesson plans ([Ahmad & Jaffar, 2003](#)). The policy says that the primary goal of the education system is to "raise people who are committed to democratic and moral values, aware of basic human rights, open to new ideas, have a sense of personal responsibility, and take part in productive activities in society for the common good". Another goal of the strategy was to make an ideal Pakistani citizen who is "independent, able to think analytically and creatively, a responsible member of society, and a global citizen" ([Muhammad & Brett, 2019](#)).

.So, the current study aims to identify the benefits and threats of ethnic and cultural diversity in the HEIs and tends to investigate the level of tolerance for potential cultural differences.

Significance of the study

The study's main goal was to examine HEIs students' attitudes toward diversity. This research would be very helpful to university presidents, chancellors, and other high-level administrators. It will also help explain why people are prejudiced in today's multiethnic society.

Objectives of study

1. To explore the prevalence of ethnic and cultural diversity in HEIs.
2. To examine the benefits and threats of ethnic and cultural diversity in HEIs.
3. To investigate the perception of students about intercultural tolerance at their HEIs.
4. To learn about prospects of inclusion in HEIs in Pakistan.

LITERATURE REVIEW

Modern civilizations rely heavily on HEIs to develop societies and the overall culture of a country. Society and the liberal state can make concerted efforts to shape "new citizens" in classroom settings. For this study, it is critical to consider how HEIs are viewed as instrumental in producing democratic citizens who can function effectively in diverse social settings and who (eventually) become contributing members of a nation's community ([Milem, 2003](#)). This institutional nature of Education is also essential to keep in mind when thinking about the roles of teachers and administrators. Educators and policymakers must find common ground among competing interests, including the state, the public, parents, and ethnic, racial, and religious groups with varying values and goals for the HEIs.

Defining cultural diversity

Defining some key terms, such as culture and cultural diversity, is essential to understand how diversity and tolerance affect the educational setting. Culture can be considered a set of shared rules and habits that change over time and affect how people see and act in the world ([Marshall, 2002](#)). Another study observed that an organization has a strong culture if its workforce is more diverse ([Aziz & Aziz, 2013](#)). Many think of cultural diversity as how people from different groups in the same place and time react to and make sense of similar events and situations ([Marshall, 2002](#)). This concept explains that the traditional cultural focus on differences between people needs to be narrower. Instead, it shows how different groups depend on each other in a system with different levels of power and dominance ([Bannerji, 2000](#); [James, 2000](#)). Students' cultural backgrounds, worldviews, and attitudes significantly affect their learning in HEIs ([Adams, 1992](#); [Gay, 2000](#); [Jones, 2004](#); [Włodkowski & Ginsberg, 1995](#)). Their cultural backgrounds affect how they learn, communicate, get motivated, get along with their peers and teachers, and what they value most in school. How comfortable kids feel in school depends mostly on how well their cultural norms and values match those of the school ([Marshall, 2002](#)).

Culture

The word "terroir" in French comes from the Latin word "coloured", which in English means "earth", "develop", "nurture", and "cultivation". In addition to its original meaning, it uses many new words related to active and supportive growth (Gollnick & Chinn, 2006). Information about a wide range of locals shows how their language, religion, diet, music, social norms, and technical skills show their unique cultural traits. Heritage, ethnicity, beliefs, behaviours, ideas, symbols, and conventions affect how a person acts (Zegarac, 2007). So, culture is the moral, spiritual, and intellectual rules for moving forward based on the values and standards of common ancestry. One's cultural identity is based on the norms and practices one takes from their group, whether one does these things alone or with others. It is a way to organize and share information about how people act as a group (American Council on Education (2012)).

Diversity

The idea of diversity includes all of these things: appreciation, admiration, and tolerance. Differences in socioeconomic background, gender, race, age, physical ability, sexual orientation, political and religious beliefs, and others can mean different things and be understood differently by each person (Adams, 1992). Most of the time, these differences are looked into in a safe, healthy, and helpful place. It is about going beyond just tolerating each other and learning to value the different ideas and experiences we all bring to the table. Diversity is the presence of many differences. An example of diversity is the growth of a wide range of people (from different racial or social backgrounds, for example) in a group or organization whose stated goal is to promote diversity in the classroom (Bannerji, 2000).

Cultural diversity and tolerance

Recently, it was said that speakers at a two-day Punjab Diversity Festival called "Hum-a-Hang Punjab-Rung Dharti Ke" urged the younger generation to be tolerant, accept others, work together, and be peaceful. The festival was held in 2019 at the Punjab Institute of Language, Arts, and Culture (PILAC). Tolerance training helps students accept linguistic, ethnographic, dietary, and other socially relevant cultural differences without condoning or encouraging extremism, violence, or other forms of intolerance (Hart, 2012). In addition to that, it was found in an empirical study that emotionally intelligent leaders have more tolerance, and they are proven as more effective and charismatic in their leadership style. Leaders play an essential role in creating an organizational climate. That means leaders can create a favourable work environment for a diverse workforce (Aziz & Al-Hamdi, 2019; Aziz & Al-Heety, 2019). More HEIs emphasize teaching tolerance in the education sector, and several public programs aim to teach tolerance to everyone. In addition, religious, humanitarian, and other community-based organizations and action groups are just a few of the many that make solving these problems a big part of their mission. Citizenship education, peace education, human rights education, intercultural conversation, and interreligious learning are all ways to teach tolerance in formal and informal settings (Jones, 2004). In the classroom, topics like peace, security, disarmament, rights, liberties, etc., are used to talk about and teach tolerance. Actions driven by students' psychosocial needs make the classroom and school environment more positive and peaceful (Hart, 2012).

Tolerance is a way of thinking that values open dialogue, deep connections, and accepting others. Reception mood is a group of emotions like tolerance that can be shown through words. It is used to measure how smart someone is. Moreover, when people of different races, nationalities, religions, sexes, and socioeconomic backgrounds participate in group activities like brainstorming or educational games, it makes them less hostile toward those who are different (Hart, 2012). Cultural diversity is one of the most important ideas about society. Some ideas discussed are traditions, customs, and an intercultural view of Education and society. Bigotry and exclusion will continue to be cultural norms until they are challenged. This will put social harmony at risk (Rosca, 2018). Accepting cultural differences shows that a person is sensitive to other cultures, tolerant, and willing to take on new challenges, all of which are important for moving up in the world. Also, another study defines cultural awareness as the increased ability of individuals to understand and internalize their cultural values, beliefs, and unique characteristics (i.e., worldview), while understanding that others may not share the same values, beliefs, and characteristics (Chang et al., 2006; Bushnaq, 2013). The basic idea behind the cultural competency approach to multicultural Education is that ideas of cultural pluralism should be fundamental in the classroom (Ng, 1995). In a perfect world, working with a more diverse group of people would be good because it encourages new ideas and makes better decisions because more people have access to more points of view. Tolerance is important in the classroom and in many other parts of society. If someone were wrongly accused of being intolerant, it would likely hurt their moral and social standing (Ng, 1995).

On the other hand, we value people, communities, and governments that are tolerant. The importance of the intercultural aspect of a significant educational process in today's society is shown by the fact that we need to be able to share our values with others and that they can add to the whole system of values in creative ways. Because of this, people are becoming more tolerant, understanding, and flexible with each other. This is a natural and necessary result (Chang et al., 2003).

Ethnic and cultural diversity in the Pakistani context

Most of the time, Punjabis, Sindhis, Pashtuns, and Balochs are used to describe the ethnicity of the people who live in Pakistan's different regions. Each region has its own culture and way of running things (Ahmad, 2008). Nevertheless, there are many smaller groups, language families, and social classes within these influential ethnic groups. Some of the most

common languages are Urdu, Punjabi, Pushto, Balochi, Sindhi, Seraiki, Hindko, Dari, and Gujrati. Urdu is the official language of Pakistan, and people all over the country speak and understand it. Most people can speak their native language and Urdu nearly as well as their own language [American Council on Education \(2012\)](#).

Similarly, most people from the country's largest ethnic groups live in their home provinces, but some live in other provinces or Iran, which is right next door. Pakistani, Afghan, and Indian media written in Urdu cover many topics ([Rehman, 2003](#)). Students from English medium and medium Urdu backgrounds are studying together in HEIs. Similarly, Pakistani HEIs have students enrolled from neighbouring countries like Afghanistan ([Shaheen et al., 2019](#); [Waseem et al., 2015](#)).

There are a lot of different ethnic groups and languages in each province. Many people in Punjab speak Seraiki, and many of them refuse to call themselves Punjabis. Balochis, Biharis, and Seraikis are also significant parts of Sindh's population, as are Muhajirs, who moved to Sindh's cities after 1947 and spoke Urdu. The Seraiki live in the southwest of the Khyber Pakhtunkhwa (previously known as North-West Frontier Province - NWFP), while the Hazaras live in the southeast. The Hazaras speak Hindko, and most of them live in the southeast. Balochistan's population comprises Pashtuns, Brahui, Dari, and Punjabi people who moved there ([Rehman, 2003](#)). Even though Pakistan has many ethnic and linguistic minorities, its national unity is mainly based on religious, historical, geographical, and political factors. Islam and the Urdu language are both important ways to bring people together. Pakistan has a lot of different languages because the people who speak them come from many different cultures and ethnic groups. In general, ethnic groups have a larger share of the population in their home province or region, where they have lived for a long time, than they do everywhere else ([Ahmad, 2008](#)). Discrimination based on a person's language or race has been common in Pakistani society, both at work and in other places ([Jaffrelot, 2002](#)).

METHODS

This is a survey-based study. University records were requested and obtained to analyze the existence of cultural and ethnic diversities among the target population, i.e., students in HEIs. A simple random technique was used to collect the data from students (n=191) in 12 different universities in Pakistan.

Measures

The authors used a scale of 8 items from the tolerance questionnaire developed by [Hjerm et al. \(2020\)](#). Three items were also added to measure others' attitudes towards tolerance by adapting from the central eight items. Cronbach's alpha was reported as 0.85. [Hofhuis et al. \(2015\)](#) scale was adapted to measure the benefits and threats of diversity. The scale has multiple items, with an overall Cronbach's alpha reported as 0.82.

After the collection of data, it was tabulated. Quantitative data was analyzed on SPSS Statistics 20 by using descriptive and inferential statistical techniques.

RESULTS AND DATA ANALYSIS

Table 1: Gender-Wise Distribution of Students Regarding Cultural Diversity

<i>Gender of Student</i>	<i>N</i>	<i>Mean</i>	<i>SD</i>
Males	97	47.10	7.271
Females	94	48.57	7.769

Table 1 shows that male students had a more comprehensive range of cultural backgrounds than female students with mean value of 48.57. The average difference between boys and girls was 0.55. As you note, the scores of female students varied more (SD = 7.69) than male students (4.53).

Table 2: System Type: Cultural Diversity

(I) Institution Name	Mean	Difference (I-J)	Sig.
Public Institutes	3.082		.007
Private Institutes	0.112		.036

* The mean difference is significant at the 0.05 level.

Table 2 reveals that the public and private sector universities are different in diversity. The public-private gap ranged from 3.082 to 0.112. The public sector universities have more cultural and ethnic diversities than private universities.

Table 3: Benefits and Threats of Diversity

Elements	M	SD	Rank
Benefits			
Understanding of Cultural & Ethnic Groups in Society	4.38	0.81	1
Creative Potential	4.01	0.74	3

Image of Social Responsibility	4.07	0.83	2
Job Market for diverse groups	3.19	0.92	5
Social Environment	3.28	0.87	4
Threats			
Realistic Threat	3.77	0.85	3
Symbolic Threat	3.62	0.82	4
Intergroup Anxiety (among diverse groups)	4.32	0.79	2
Productivity Loss (among diverse groups)	4.41	0.72	1

Table 3 shows that respondents have an overall positive attitude towards the benefits of diversity. The mean scores for *understanding cultural & ethnic groups in society*, *creative potential* and *image of social responsibility* are reported as 4.38, 4.01 and 4.07, respectively, which is a positive sign. However, the *job market* for diverse groups and *social environment* were reported as 3.19 and 3.28, which were low scores. It reveals that students perceive that minority groups face challenges in the social environment and get job opportunities in the market.

Table 4: Elements of Tolerance

Items	M	SD	Rank
People have the right to live as they wish in my university	4.31	0.92	2
People have the freedom to live their life as they choose at my university	3.89	0.87	6
It is okay for people to live as they wish as long as they do not harm others	4.06	0.83	5
I respect other people's beliefs and opinions	4.51	0.79	1
I respect other people's opinions, even when I disagree	4.12	0.91	3
I like to spend time with people who are different from me	3.87	0.88	7
I like people who challenge me to think about the world in a different way	4.11	0.74	4
Society benefits from a diversity of traditions and lifestyles	3.66	0.86	9
Other people respect my beliefs and opinions	3.18	0.93	8
Other people respect my opinions, even when they disagree with mine	3.06	0.85	11
Other people like to spend time with people who are different from them	3.39	0.78	10

Table 4 describes different elements of intercultural tolerance in HEIs of Pakistan. The results indicate that most students are quite optimistic about their own attitude towards cultural and ethnic diversities, as can be noticed in item number 1, 4 and 5, which were reported as 4.31, 4.51 and 4.12, respectively. On the other hand, respondents negatively perceive others' attitudes towards cultural and ethnic diversities. It is evident from item numbers 9, 10 and 11, which have low scores of 3.18, 3.06 and 3.39, respectively. This explains that respondents feel that other students have a very low level of respect for respondents beliefs and opinions. In addition to that, respondents also perceive that other students prefer to spend less time with people from different ethnicities and cultures in the HEIs.

DISCUSSION

This study aimed to discover the threats and benefits of diversity and intercultural tolerance in HEIs. Diversity is prevalent in HEIs of Pakistan. The study's findings showed that there are few benefits of diversity, but at the same time, respondents highlighted some threats caused by diversity in HEIs. Higher Education is one of the essential parts of a person's educational path. It happens at this point and in all of the stages that follow. Cultural norms significantly affect how men and women act and look. An essential part of learning is how a person was raised in a community or society. How people dress, how they think, and what they eat have a significant effect on their priorities and interests in Education. This study aimed to find out how HEIs students from different cultures behave in different fields.

There are several studies which pointed out the benefits of cultural diversity in higher Education for example [Pascarella et al. \(2001\)](#), [Chang \(1999\)](#), [Kuh, Schuh, Whitt, and Associates \(2009\)](#) identified many benefits of diversity. Similarly, [American Association of Universities, \(1977\)](#); [Feldman and Newcomb, 1969](#); [Pascarella and Terenzini, 2001](#)), identified individual student growth and change due to diversity.

According to the findings of the study, it is established that there is a good level of intercultural tolerance for a few elements of the tolerance scale. However, on the contrary, there is a lack of intercultural tolerance for some other elements of tolerance, which shows a dire need to develop a culture of inclusion in HEIs. This inclusive environment could support culturally based Education and point students from different backgrounds in the right direction. HEIs must ensure that their students feel safe and cared for, irrespective of their culture and ethnicity. Intercultural tolerance should be taught in the HEIs curriculum.

Scholars like [Chang \(1999\)](#); and [Gurin \(1999\)](#) identified three broad categories as an outcome of diversity viz citizenship engagement, racial/cultural engagement, and compatibility of differences. Studies also revealed that diversity has a positive effect on student retention.

Exposure to different cultural points of view is beneficial for teaching, raising children, and passing on knowledge. Family, neighbourhood, and social norms all influence how children grow and develop. Today's students can learn from cultural

practices, event celebrations, cultural festivals, and other things that happen in society. These methods may be the same as it is or different from traditional ways of teaching and learning. For students to grow, they needed a model encouraging them to work together across cultural lines. So, a student's overall growth can be helped by incorporating cultural beliefs and practices into a learning framework.

CONCLUSION

The study concludes that ethnic and cultural diversity is prevailing in HEIs of Pakistan. There are some benefits of diversity. Students responded positively about the understanding of cultural & ethnic groups in society, creative potential, and image of social responsibility in their HEIs. However, the job market for diverse groups and social environments was reported to have shallow scores. It means that students perceive that minority groups face challenges in the social environment and get job opportunities in the market. Similarly, intergroup anxiety and productivity loss are also reported as threats to diversity in HEIs.

The study also concluded that most students are optimistic about their intercultural tolerance for other cultures and ethnic diversities. On the other hand, respondents negatively perceive others' attitudes towards cultural and ethnic diversities. This explains that respondents feel that other students have a very low level of intercultural tolerance for respondents' beliefs and opinions. Results also indicate that respondents perceive that many students prefer to spend less time with people from different ethnicities and cultures in the HEIs, which is not a positive sign. So, it is concluded that positive and negative attitudes are prevailing toward diversity and intercultural tolerance. Nevertheless, holistic efforts by policymakers and top management can nurture a culture of inclusion in the HEIs of Pakistan.

RECOMMENDATIONS

Policymakers should aim to promote an inclusive learning environment at Pakistani HEIs where diversity's risks are few, and its advantages are high. Diversity is a fact of life. Thus, everyone should celebrate and appreciate it. Seminars, parties, holidays, and visits to family are suitable methods to do this. HEI teacher training programs should be evaluated multiculturally. Culturally responsive Education and acceptance can help diversity-related issues. Pakistan may prioritize higher Education to obtain a quality education.

LIMITATIONS OF THE STUDY

This study was limited to higher educational institutes only.

CO-AUTHORS CONTRIBUTION

The first and second authors conceived of the presented idea. The third author developed the theory and performed the computations. The fourth and fifth authors verified the analytical methods. All authors discussed the results and contributed to the final manuscript.

REFERENCES

1. Adams, M. (1992). Cultural inclusion in the American college classroom. *New Direction for Teaching and Learning*, 1992(49), 5-17. <https://doi.org/10.1002/tl.37219924903>
2. Ahmad, I. (2008). The anatomy of an Islamic model: Citizenship education in Pakistan. In *Citizenship curriculum in Asia and the Pacific* (pp. 97–109). Springer, Dordrecht. https://doi.org/10.1007/978-1-4020-8745-5_6
3. Ahmad, & Jaffar, S. (2003). Teaching Human Rights. In *The Subtle Subversion: The State of Curricula and Textbooks in Pakistan Urdu, English, Social Studies and Civics*, edited by Abdul Hameed Nayyar and Ahmed Salim, 107–118.
4. Aziz, M. F., & Aziz, S. (2013). Employees' perception of organizational culture, with and without ethnic diversity. *Elixir Journal, Human Res. Mgmt.* 61, 17133-17138.
5. Aziz, M. F., & Al-Hamdi, S. S. (2019). Does Emotional Intelligence Predict Charisma in The Leaders? *International Journal of Economics, Commerce, and Management*, VII(7), 244-255.
6. Aziz, M. F., & Al-Heety, S. N. (2019). Impact of Leadership on Employee Innovative Work Behavior: A Nationwide Empirical Study. *Science International*, 31(3), 403–407.
7. American Council on Education (2012). *On the Importance of Diversity in Higher Education* Retrieved on 22-12-15 from <http://www.acenet.edu/news>
8. Association of American Universities. (1997). On the importance of diversity in university admissions. The New York Times, April 24, A27. Retrieved on 4-1-16 from <http://www.upenn.edu/almanac/v43/n35/aau.html>
9. Bushnaq, T. (2013). Developing cultural competence – a professional imperative for foreign language university teachers. *International Scientific Symposium, Chisinau*, 1(2), 103–108.
10. Banks, J. A. (Ed.). (2009). *The Routledge international companion to multicultural Education* (p. 9). New York: Routledge. <https://doi.org/10.4324/9780203881514>
11. Bannerji, H. (2000). *The dark side of the nation: Essays on multiculturalism, nationalism and gender*. Canadian Scholars' Press.

12. Chang, M. J., Denson, N., Saenz, V., & Misa, K. (2006). The educational benefits of sustaining cross-racial interaction among undergraduates. *The Journal of Higher Education*, 77(3), 430-455. <https://doi.org/10.1353/jhe.2006.0018>
13. Chang, M. J., Witt, D., Jones, J., & Hakuta, K. (Eds.). (2003). *Compelling interest: Examining the evidence on racial dynamics in colleges and universities*. Stanford University Press. <https://doi.org/10.1515/9780804764537>
14. Chang, M. J. (1999). Does racial diversity matter? The educational impact of a racially diverse. *Journal of College Student Development*, 40(4), 377-395.
15. Gollnick, D. M., & Chinn, P. C. (2006). *Multicultural Education in a pluralist society* (7th Ed.). Upper Saddle River, Pearson.
16. Gay, G. (2000). *Culturally responsive teaching: Theory, research and practice*. Teachers College Press.
17. Hart, C. S. (2012). *Aspirations, Education and social justice: Applying Sen and Bourdieu*. A&C Black.
18. Hjerm, M., Eger, M. A., Bohman, A., & Connolly, F. F. (2020). A new approach to the study of tolerance is conceptualizing and measuring acceptance, respect, and appreciation of difference. *Social Indicators Research*, p. 147(9), 897-919. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s11205-019-02176-y>
19. Hofhuis, J., van der Zee, K. I., & Otten, S. (2015). Measuring employee perception on the effects of cultural diversity at work: Development of the benefits and threats of diversity scale. *Quality & Quantity*, 49(1), 177-201. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s11135-013-9981-7>
20. Jackson, R. (2019). Postscript on Dialogue and Inclusive Religious Education: The ReDi Studies in a European Context. *Religion & Education*, 46(1), 130-146. <https://doi.org/10.1080/15507394.2019.1577708>
21. Jones, E. B. (2004). Culturally relevant strategies for the classroom. *Diversity in college classrooms: Practices for today's campuses*. Michigan Publications. <https://doi.org/10.3998/mpub.23732>
22. Jaffrelot, C. (2002). *A History of Pakistan and Its Origins*, Anthem Press.
23. James, C. E. (2000). *Experience difference*. Fernwood.
24. Kuh, G., Schuh, J.S., Whitt, E.J., Andreas, R.E., Lyons, J.W., Strange, C.C., Krehbiel, L.E., & MacKay, K.A. (1991). *Involving colleges: Successful approaches to fostering student learning and personal development outside the classroom*. Jossey-Bass.
25. Maussen, M., & Bader, V. (2012) *Tolerance and diversity challenges in European Education, in tolerance and cultural diversity in schools*, 2012(1), 21-27.
26. Milem, J. F. (2003). The educational benefits of diversity: Evidence from multiple sectors. *Compelling interest*, 1-27. <https://doi.org/10.1515/9780804764537-009>
27. Marshall, P. L. (2002). *Cultural diversity in our schools*. Belmont, CA: Wadsworth/Thomson Learning.
28. Muhammad, Y., & Brett, P. (2019). Addressing social justice and cultural identity in Pakistani Education: A qualitative content analysis of curriculum policy. In *Education, ethnicity and equity in the multilingual Asian context* (pp. 235-253). Springer, Singapore. https://doi.org/10.1007/978-981-13-3125-1_14
29. Pascarella, E. T., & Terenzini, P. T. (2001). How college affects students. Jossey- Bass.
30. Rehman, J. (2003). Conceptual Analysis of the Rights of Ethnic, Linguistic and Religious Minorities. *The Weaknesses in the International Protection of Minority Rights* (pp. 10-28). Brill Nijhoff. https://doi.org/10.1163/9789004478466_005
31. Ng, R., Staton, P. A., & Scane, J. (Eds.). (1995). *Anti-racism, feminism, and critical approaches to Education*. Greenwood Publishing Group.
32. Rosca, M. (2018). From Exclusivism to Pluralism: A Reflection on European Religious Minorities. *The Age of Human Rights Journal*, 7(10), 139-158. <https://doi.org/10.17561/tahrj.n10.7>
33. Shah, F. A. (2018). *Cultural diversity in a public sector university of Pakistan: Exploring students' perceptions and experiences* (Unpublished master's dissertation). Aga Khan University, Karachi, Pakistan.
34. Shaheen, U., Rafi, M. S., Aziz, S., & Ain, N. U. (2019). Meeting Diversity in ESL Classroom: A Pedagogical Model for a Globalized Milieu. *The Journal of Teaching English for Specific and Academic Purposes*, 7(2), 237-253. <https://doi.org/10.22190/JTESAP1902237S>
35. Turkan, A. (2015). A longitudinal investigation of perceptions towards university concept through metaphors: A university Sample in Turkey. *Educational Research and Reviews*, 10(1), 36-49. <https://doi.org/10.5897/ERR2014.1846>
36. Waseem, F., Naveed, A., & Aziz, S. (2015). Does schooling make a difference in English language proficiency? A comparison of Pakistani undergraduate students coming from English and Urdu medium schools. *European Academic Research*, 3(8), 8628-8652.
37. Wlodkowski, R. J., & Ginsberg, M. B. (1995). *Diversity & Motivation: Culturally Responsive Teaching*. Jossey-Bass Higher and Adult Education Series. Jossey-Bass Education Series, Jossey-Bass Social and Behavioral Science Series. Jossey-Bass Inc., 350 Sansome St., San Francisco, CA 94104.
38. Zegarac, V. (2007). A cognitive pragmatic perspective on communication and culture. *Handbook of intercultural communication*, pp. 7, 31. <https://doi.org/10.1515/9783110198584.1.31>